

CRITICAL NOTES ON GALEN'S *DE VENAE SECTIONE ADVERSUS ERASISTRATEOS ROMAE DEAGENTES* [K XI 187-249]

THE treatise was in origin a polemic against the Erasistrateans in Rome whom Galen found to be in opposition to his own views. It is of interest not only for Galen's views on venesection but also for the fragments of the writings of Erasistratus contained in it. The text has not yet appeared in a modern critical edition. The Kühn edition of 1826 is the most recent, but Kühn did not go beyond the work of the Renaissance editors in dealing with the numerous corruptions of the text. The emendations proposed below are occasioned by the want of a satisfactory reading anywhere in the tradition.

The two oldest surviving manuscripts of this work are both of the fourteenth century and both are fragmentary: Ambrosianus gr. 129 (A) and Laurentianus plut. LXXIV. 22 (L). Except for one small section, the texts of A and L are not coextensive. Two fifteenth-century manuscripts, Urbinas gr. 70 (U) and Marcianus gr. 279 (M), are descendants of A through a lost intermediary manuscript. The Aldine edition (S) of 1525 is based solely upon A. Sections of the text of A have been lost from the manuscript since the time that the Aldine and the ancestor of UM were copied; the latter are therefore important witnesses. Of the manuscripts, only U contains the whole of the surviving text without loss or omission. The Basel edition of 1538 (B) and the Chartier edition of 1679 (C) are both based upon the Aldine. The Kühn edition of 1826 (K) in turn is based upon B and C and varies from them only insignificantly. No critical apparatus is to be found in any of the editions.

A = Ambrosianus gr. 129

L = Laurentianus plut. LXXIV. 22

U = Urbinas gr. 70

M = Marcianus gr. 279

S = editio Aldina ab Opizone et Clemente curata Venetiis a. 1525

B = editio Basileensis Hieronymi Gemusaei a. 1583

C = editio Parisiensis Renati Charterii a. 1679

K = editio Kuehniana Lipsiae 1826

α littera incerta

< > inserui, non exstant in codicibus

[] delevi, exstant in codicibus

/ finis lineae in codice

All other symbols are recorded as found in the MSS. or edd. Page references are to the Kühn edition, and the text printed at the start of each of my discussions is that of Kühn.

K 194. 11

διὸ καὶ παρεκάλεσεν ὁ Τεύθρας ὑπαγορεῦσαι μεταλελεγμένα τῷ πρὸς αὐτοῦ πεμ-
φθησομένῳ παιδί.

μεταλελεγμένα edd.: μετὰ λελεγμένα UM

Read: με τὰ λελεγμένα

‘It was for this reason that Teuthras asked me to dictate my remarks to the servant whom he would send.’

K 198. 1

μανίας γὰρ ἐσχάτης ἔργον οἶεσθαι διὰ τοῦτ’ Ἐρασίστρατον ἐφ’ ὧν εἰρήκαμεν ὀλίγον ἔμπροσθεν παθῶν σεσιγηκέναι τὴν φλεβοτομίαν, ὅτι κενοῦσθαι τὰς φλέβας ἀξιοὶ καὶ τοῦτον τίθεσθαι τῆς θεραπείας τὸν σκοπὸν, ὅγε τοι τούτῳ πεισθεὶς ἐφ’ ὧν ἂν εὖροι παθῶν Ἐρασίστρατον ἀσιτίαν συμβουλευόντα.

ὅγε τοι τούτῳ πεισθεὶς edd.: ὁ γέ τοι τούτῳ πεισθεὶς UM

Read: εἶγε τις τούτοις πεισθείη

‘It is extreme madness to think that the reason that Erasistratus does not mention phlebotomy for the diseases we mentioned a little while ago is that he thought it best for the veins to be evacuated and to make this the objective of the therapy, if one should be persuaded by cases in which one might find Erasistratus prescribing fasting.’

K 201. 1

. . . οἷ τε πυρετοὶ συνεχέστεροι ἦσαν ἢ καὶ τῷ σώματι ᾧ ἐνεδίδουν καὶ βῆχες ἡκολούθουν σφοδραί.

ᾧ ἐνεδίδουν U edd.: ᾧ ἐνεδίδοαν M: litterae incertae L

Read: . . . οἷ τε πυρετοὶ συνεχέστεροι ἦσαν ἢ <πρότερον> καὶ τῷ σώματι <ὅλ>ω ἀνεδίδουν καὶ βῆχες ἡκολούθουν σφοδραί.

‘. . . the fevers were more continuous than previously, and they spread over the whole body, and intense coughing followed.’

The sentence demands a word such as <πρότερον>. As it stands in the manuscripts, ᾧ ἐνεδίδουν makes no sense. It would appear that the case under consideration is one which involves the concept of metastasis, and therefore the reading <ὅλ>ω ἀνεδίδουν is required (cf. K 207 ff.).

K 201. 5–7 (Cf. also K 202. 1–4)

. . . τῇ δὲ λοιπῇ θεραπείᾳ χρώμεθα, ὡς εἰθίσμεθα πρὸς τὰ τοιαῦτα τὰ τ’ ἄλλα καὶ πρὸς τὴν θεραπείαν περίοδον τῶν καθάρσεων προσλαμβάνοντες ὑπεστέλλομεν τὰ σιτία, . . .

χρώμεθα UM edd.: ἐχρώμεθα L | τοιαῦτα τὰ τ’ ἄλλα edd.: τοιαῦτά τ’ ἄλλα UM: cf. Arist. 378^a24 τὰλλα τὰ τοιαῦτα | καὶ ante τῶν καθάρσεων L | περίοδον L edd.: περίοδοι UM (περίοδον vel περίοδοι L, K 202. 3) | προσλαμβάνοντες UM edd.: προλαμβάνοντες L (προλαμβάνοντες UMS, K 202. 3) | ὑπεστέλλομεν L edd.: ἐπεστέλλομεν UM

Read: . . . τῇ δὲ λοιπῇ θεραπείᾳ ἐχρώμεθα ἢ εἰθίσμεθα πρὸς τὰ τοιαῦτα τὰλλα, καὶ πρὸς τὴν θεραπείαν <τὴν> περίοδον τῶν καθάρσεων προλαμβάνοντες ὑπεστέλλομεν τὰ σιτία, . . .

‘. . . we continued the rest of the treatment that we used for such other conditions, and with a view to the treatment, anticipating the menstrual period, we restricted food.’

The reading *ἐχρώμεθα* in L is preferable in that it parallels *ὑπεστέλλομεν*. Later in the treatise *προλαμβάνοντες* appears in UMS when the passage is again quoted, and it is also the reading of L.

K 206. 14

ἐν τούτοις οὖν ὄντος τοῦ Κρίτωνος, τῇ μὲν πρώτῃ ἡμέρᾳ βοηθοῦμεν πυριῶντες σπόγγοις τὸν εἰθισμένον τρόπον ὅποτε διελείπομεν τὰ καταπλάσματα ἐπιθέμενα, ὥστε διὰ παντὸς ἐν θεραπείᾳ εἶναι.

ἐπιθέμενα UM edd.: ἐπιτιθέμενα ut videtur L | διαλείπομεν recte UMC: διαλείπομεν SCK

Read: ἐπιτιθέμενοι

‘Since Crito is in this condition, on the first day we treat him by applying heat with sponges in the usual manner whenever we stop applying poultices so that he is continually in therapy.’

K 208. 16

. . . ὁψὲ δὲ τῆς ὥρας καὶ ἀναισθησία τις ἐγένετο, ὥστε καὶ τὸ οὖρον ἐκ τοῦ στρώματος προῖεσθαι, . . .

καὶ ante ἀναισθησία LUM: deest edd. | ἐκ τοῦ στρώματος CK: ἐκ γαστρω^{μτ} U: ἐκ γαστρ^{μτ} M: ἐκ γαστρώματος SB: ἐκ τοῦ στρώ. in margine B: ἐνερθέντο ut videtur L | προῖοντο L

Read: ἐκ ταῦτομάτου προῖεσθαι, . . .

‘. . . late in the day there was also some loss of sensation, with the result that there was involuntary micturition; . . .’

Cf. Hipp. *Aph.* III, 78; VI, 15. The Aldine reading *γαστρώματος* looks as if it should mean a *swelling of the abdominal region*. While it is a distinct possibility that there will be a great distention of the bladder if the patient has been suffering from retention of urine, no parallel can be found in Greek for this particular formation. The reading *ἐκ τοῦ στρώ(ματος)* from the margin of B is impossible in sense. I am indebted to Professor J. B. McDiarmid for his valuable suggestions regarding the reading *ἐκ ταῦτομάτου*.

K 209. 5

ἄμεινον δ’ ἦν εἰ μὴ τῶν παθῶν εἶποις, ἀλλὰ παθῶν αἰτίου πλήθους.

εἶποις edd. et ut videtur L: εἶπες UM | τῶν post ἀλλὰ UM, deest edd.: ἀλλὰ τοῦ τῶν παθῶν αἰτίου L

Read: ἄμεινον δ’ ἦν εἰ μὴ τῶν παθῶν εἶπες, ἀλλὰ τῶν παθῶν αἰτίου πλήθους.

‘But you would have been more correct if you had not said *of the disease*, but rather *of the cause of the disease*, *plethos*.’

K 210. 16

τίς δ’ ἀνέξεται λεγόντων ἀνθρώπων τὰ μὲν μικρὰ . . .

ἀνθρώπων edd.: ἀνῶν (ἀνθρώπων) LUM: cf. ἡμῶν λεγόντων l. 12 supra

Read: λεγόντων ἡμῶν τὰ μὲν μικρὰ . . .

‘And who will tolerate it when we say that the small things . . .’

K 213. 14

καὶ τοῖνυν καὶ γράφουσιν ἐν τοῖς βιβλίοις ἅπανιν ἐφ' ὧν ἂν πράττουσι βοηθημάτων
ἐξῆς ταῦτα σύμπαντα, . . .

πράττουσι UM edd.

Read: *πράττωσι*

'Moreover, in all their books they set down all these matters systematically in connection with whatever treatments they perform; . . .'

K 216. 1-6

τίς ἂν οὖν οὐ πεισθῇ τὸν οὕτως ἐπιμελῇ κεχρησθαι μὲν ὁμοίως τοῖς ἄλλοις, φλεβο-
τομίας μηδαμόθεν δ' αὐτῆς μνημονεῖσαι πλὴν ἅπαξ ἐν τῷ περὶ αἵματος ἀναγωγῆς;
οὐδ' οὖν οὐδὲ τότε χρώμενον, ἀλλὰ τοῦναντίον ἅπαν ἐπαινοῦντα τὸν Χρύσιππον ἐπὶ
τῷ μὴ χρησθαι φλεβοτομία;

τίς οὖν οὕτω πεισθείης ut videtur L | φλεβοτομίας UM edd.: φλεβοτομία L | δ' ante αὐτῆς
inseruit C, recep. K | τῷ μὴ χρησθαι LCK: τὸ μὴ χρησθαι UMSB

Read: *τίς ἂν οὖν [οὐ] πεισθῇ τὸν οὕτως ἐπιμελῇ κεχρησθαι μὲν ὁμοίως τοῖς
ἄλλοις φλεβοτομία, μηδαμόθεν δ' αὐτῆς μνημονεῖσαι πλὴν ἅπαξ ἐν τῷ περὶ αἵματος
ἀναγωγῆς, οὐδ' οὖν οὐδὲ τότε χρώμενον, ἀλλὰ τοῦναντίον ἅπαν ἐπαινοῦντα τὸν
Χρύσιππον ἐπὶ τῷ μὴ χρησθαι φλεβοτομία;*

'Who could believe that such a careful man used phlebotomy in the same way as the other remedies but mentioned it nowhere except once in the work *On the Expectoration of Blood*, and not even then because he was using it but on the contrary because he was praising Chrysippus for not using it?'

K 219. 2

. . . τινὲς δὲ πάμπολλα ἡγούμενοι καὶ παρὰ τοῦτο γίνεσθαι διαφοράν

πάμπολλα UM edd.: παμπόλλην ut videtur L | διαφοράν LUM edd.

Read: *παμπόλλας . . . διαφοράς*

' . . . and others believing that even here there are numerous differences, . . .'

For the plural cf. e.g. K 219. 19.

K 222. 7-11

πανσάσθωσαν οὖν ἤδη λωβώμενοι τοῖς γε μανθάνουσι τὴν τέχνην καὶ τοῖς νοσοῦσιν
αὐτοῖς οἱ λέγοντες Ἐρασίστρατον κεχρησθαι μὲν τῇ φλεβοτομία, λόγον δ' οὐδένα
πεποιῆσθαι περὶ αὐτῆς, ὡς παραδήλου πᾶσιν οὔσης μᾶλλον ἢ τῆς τῶν καταπλα-
σμάτων τε καὶ λαχάνων ἐψησεως.

λωβώμενοι CK: λοβούμενοι UM et ut videtur L: λαβούμενοι S: †λαβούμενοι in textu, λωβω in
margine B

Read: *λυμαινόμενοι (cf. K 223. 12 . . . λυμαίνονται τοῖς νοσοῦσιν) . . . κατα-
πλασμάτων <χρησέως> . . .*

'So let there now be an end to the outrage against those who understand the technique and against the sick themselves from those who say that Erasistratus used phlebotomy but that he did not mention it because it was more obvious to everyone than the use of bandages or boiling of vegetables.'

K 232. 6–11

ἐναργῶς γὰρ φαίνεται πᾶσιν ἀνθρώποις. ὅσοι γὰρ ἔχουσιν νοῦν τε καὶ σμικρὸν ὥστε σκοπεῖν ὡς θεμένῳ, τὸ παρεμπεπτωκὸς εἰς τὰς ἀρτηρίας αἷμα διὰ τοῦ κενῶσαι τὰς φλέβας εἰς τὴν οἰκείαν ἐπανάγειν χώραν, ὅτι τάχιστα τοῦτ' εἶναι πρακτέον.

ὅσοι γὰρ edd.: ὅσα γὰρ U: ὅσα vel ὅσοι γὰρ A | ἔχουσιν U edd.: ἔχουσι A | νοῦν U edd.: νοῦν ut videtur A | σμικρὸν A | ὥστε BCK: ὡς τ' AU: ὡς* S | σκοπεῖν edd.: σκοπὸν U: σκοπὸν vel σκοπεῖν A | ὡς θεμένῳ CK: ὡς θεμεν^ω AU: ὡς θεμένῳ SB | εἶναι edd.: εἶ U: εἶ vel εἶναι A

Read: ἐναργὲς γὰρ φαίνεται πᾶσιν ἀνθρώποις ὅσοι περ ἔχουσι νοῦν γε καὶ σμικρὸν ὡς τῷ σκοπῷ ὑποθεμένῳ τὸ παρεμπεπτωκὸς εἰς τὰς ἀρτηρίας αἷμα διὰ τοῦ κενῶσαι τὰς φλέβας εἰς τὴν οἰκείαν ἐπανάγειν χώραν, ὅτι τάχιστα τοῦτ' εἶναι πρακτέον.

'For it appears self-evident to everyone who has even slight intelligence that, if a man has made it his object to cause the blood that has entered the arteries to return to its proper place through the evacuation of the veins, he ought to effect the evacuation as soon as possible.'

K 239. 14

ἕκαστον οὖν δεῖ συνθροτὰ εἰθισμένα ἑαυτῷ συμβαίνειν τὴν ἀρμόζουσαν φυλακὴν γιγνομένοις πάθεσι ποιεῖσθαι.

συνθροτὰ BCK: συνθρω τὰ U: συν θρωτὰ M: συν / θρωτὰ A: σὺν θρωτὰ S: συναρθροῦντα τὰ L

Read: συννοοῦντα τὰ εἰθισμένα

'It is necessary, therefore, to keep in mind what usually happens to each patient and take the precaution appropriate to his illness at the onset.'

The reading *συναρθροῦντα* in L might alternatively suggest *συναριθμοῦντα*, 'enumerating'.

K 242. 15–243. 3

ἐν ταύταις διαθέσεσι καὶ πολλοῖς γε ἤδη πρὸ ἡμῶν ἐγνώσθησαν αἱ τοιαῦται διαθέσεις ὑπὲρ ὧν ἐτέρωθι κάλλιον εἰπεῖν. ἐν δὲ τῷ παρόντι μέχρι τοσούτου λελέχθαι, μετρίως δηλούντων ἡμῶν ὅτι πολλοὶ τῶν ἐπιλήπτων ὑπὸ τῶν μακροτέρων ἀσιτιῶν κακούμενοι τὸν στόμαχον ἐξ αὐτοῦ τούτου παροξύνονται.

τῶν pro ὧν M | τοσούτου L edd.: τοσοῦτον τοσοῦτου AUM

Read: [ἐν ταύταις ταῖς διαθέσεσι] καὶ πολλοῖς γε ἤδη πρὸ ἡμῶν ἐγνώσθησαν αἱ τοιαῦται διαθέσεις ὑπὲρ ὧν ἐτέρωθι κάλλιον εἰπεῖν, ἐν δὲ τῷ παρόντι μέχρι τοσούτου λελέχθαι, μετρίως δηλούντων ἡμῶν ὅτι πολλοὶ τῶν ἐπιλήπτων ὑπὸ τῶν μακροτέρων ἀσιτιῶν κακούμενοι τὸν στόμαχον ἐξ αὐτοῦ τούτου παροξύνονται.

'Furthermore such conditions have been recognized by many before us, but it is better to speak about them elsewhere and for the present to let what has been said suffice, since it is clear enough from what I have said that many epileptics whose stomachs are adversely affected by extended fasting have seizures just because of it.'

K 247. 3-6

ἀλλ' οὐδὲν τούτων ὁρῶντες ἔνιοι τῶν Ἐρασιστρατείων εἶπερ φασὶν ὡς κενωτικοῦ τε βοηθήματος χρῆται τῇ φλεβοτομίᾳ, καὶ γὰρ Ἐρασιστράτου σαφῶς εἰρηκότος αὐτὸ τὸ ἐναντιώτατον.

οὐδ' ἐν M | ὁρῶντες edd.: ὁρῶντες AUM | ἐρασιστρατείων UM | φασὶν M: φασὶ U edd. et ut videtur A | κενωτικοῦ τε βοηθήματος edd.: κενωτικοῦ βοηθήματος UM: κενωτικῇ βοήθημ(α)τι A ut videtur

Read: ἀλλ' οὐδὲν τούτων ὁρῶσιν ἔνιοι τῶν Ἐρασιστρατείων εἶπερ φασὶν ὡς κενωτικῶ [τε] βοηθήματι χρῆται τῇ φλεβοτομίᾳ, καίπερ Ἐρασιστράτου σαφῶς εἰρηκότος αὐτὸ τὸ ἐναντιώτατον.

'But some of the Erasistrateans perceive none of these facts since they say he employs phlebotomy as an evacuative remedy when in fact he has clearly stated the very opposite.'

K 249. 1

εἰρήσεται δὲ καὶ περὶ τοῦ πλεονάκεις ἢ ἅπαξ ἀφαιρεῖν, ἐπὶ τε τούτων οὐδὲν ἥττον ὥς τινες ἐν ἡρὶ φλεβοτομεῖν ἢ καθαίρειν ἔτι ὑγιαίνοντας προσήκει.

τινες UM edd.: τῶν¹ A

Read: ἐπὶ τε τούτοις and ὥς τινες

'I shall also speak about the <question of a> repeated or single withdrawal of blood, and last but not least, about the advisability of phlebotomy or purging in spring for some patients who are still healthy.'

University of California, Irvine

RONALD F. KOTRČ